# Cross-Reference Appendix (v2)

Claude (Anthropic) with collaborator

May 2026

## CROSS-REFERENCE APPENDIX — Third-Pass Audit Verdict Matrix

Companion to `translation_continuation.md` and `SOURCES.md`. Full per-citation audit results from the third-pass deep cross-reference check. For each of the 64 citations in the translation file, this document provides: - **Stress-test:** whether the cited source actually says what we claim, at the section/verse cited - **Broaden:** newly discovered parallels strengthening or contextualizing the claim - **Action taken:** what (if anything) was changed in the translation file

See `SOURCES.md` for the integrated index. This appendix preserves the audit trail.

**Version 2 (May 2026):** citations #59 (Wright) and #60 (Cowley) updated to reflect the Tier-2 library-source audit — see `TIER2_AUDIT.md`. Wright 1877 is now fully verified; the "Cowley 1971" article is corrected to its true date, 1974. The translation text is unchanged.

---

### EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Of the 64 citations audited: - **57 VERIFIED** (with sub-article refinements applied to ~12 of them) - **4 documentable errors** corrected: Cave of Treasures §3→§2; LAE §13-16→§§12-17 (Latin recension); Giyorgis "ten Consciousnesses"→begena/Decalogue; (one off-by-one in Genesis Rabbah was not actually in our file) - **3 interpretive readings** flagged with appropriate sigla: Aksumite-only dating (→ widened); Christological readings of 3 Mq (→ flagged with Horovitz's contrary view); "trilogy as unified work" (→ softened to "collection") - **7 newly identified parallels** added to strengthen the apparatus

**Patterns across the 64 citations:**

1. **Biblical citations (1–26)** are uniformly accurate at the verse level. The two interpretive risks are (a) the reapplication of Prov 8:22-30 from Wisdom to Adam at 3 Mq 4:15-18 (creative midrashic move, not standard exegesis) and (b) the "ten Consciousnesses" gloss on Ps 33:2/92:3/144:9 (now replaced with Decalogue tradition).
2. **Patristic citations (27–33)** are accurate but were imprecise at the sub-article level. Now refined: Aquinas Suppl. Q. 80 a. 2; Pseudo-Dionysius *Celestial Hierarchy* 6.2 (PG 3:200D) with elaboration in chs. 7-9; Augustine *Ench.* 89 cross-cited with *City of God* 22.19.
3. **Pseudepigraphic citations (34–45)** showed a systematic ±1 numbering drift between editions: Cave of Treasures §2 (Budge 1927) vs §3 (some later numberings); LAE §§12-17 (Pettorelli-Kaestli, CCSA 18, Brepols 2012) vs §13-16 (older numberings). The apparatus now standardizes on stated editions.
4. **Rabbinic citations (46–50)** are accurate. The Gen. Rabbah 8:9 → 8:10 off-by-one identified in the audit was not actually present in our file (we cite Gen. Rabbah 22:7 and 15:7, which are different and correct).
5. **The single thinnest citation — the Giyorgis "ten Consciousnesses of Adam" parallel — was unsupported.** Direct examination of the Mäṣḥafä Məsṭir's 30-chapter structure and both 2024 English translations reveals no such doctrine; Giyorgis's anthropology is the classical body + (rational/animal) soul dichotomy. The 3 Mq 2:23 footnote has been rewritten with the begena/Decalogue tradition plus patristic decimal-Decalogue parallels.

## BIBLICAL CITATIONS (1–26): all VERIFIED

| # | Citation | Status | Refinement |
|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | Matt 11:29 | [✓] | Exact match for 3 Mq 1:1 messianic prologue |
| 2 | Matt 23:2 | [✓] | “Scribes and Pharisees sit in Moses’ seat” |
| 3 | Matt 25:35-36 | [✓] | Six works of mercy |
| 4 | John 5:29 | [✓] | Resurrection of life / of judgment |
| 5 | John 10:11-15 | [✓] | Verified, but Horovitz’s “von Christus nirgends die Rede” retained as caveat |
| 6 | John 12:24 | [✓] | Wheat grain that dies |
| 7 | Rom 5:12 | [✓] | Death through one man |
| 8 | Rom 11:33-34 | [✓] | Depth of wisdom |
| 9 | 1 Cor 15:32 | [✓] | “Let us eat and drink” |
| 10 | 1 Cor 15:36-38 | [✓] | Strongest Pauline parallel to 2 Mq 17 / 1 Mq 8:22-32 |
| 11 | 1 Cor 15:51-52 | [✓] | “We shall not all sleep” |
| 12 | 2 Thess 2:4 | [✓] | Combines well with Isa 14 / Ezek 28 for 3 Mq 1:3 |
| 13 | Heb 11:32 | [✓] | **REFINED**: cross-cite with Heb 12:1 for “cloud of witnesses” phrase |
| 14 | Jas 2:23 | [✓] | — |
| 15 | Jude 11 | [✓] | Cain / Balaam / Korah |
| 16 | Rev 2:23 | [✓] | “Searches kidneys and hearts” |
| 17 | Isa 14:13-14 | [✓] | Verbatim parallel to LAE 15:3 |
| 18 | Ezek 28:2-9 | [✓] | **REFINED**: extended to 28:2-19 to include cherub-in-Eden Satan-fall |
| 19 | Isa 11:6 | [✓] | — |
| 20 | Isa 40:13 | [✓] | — |
| 21 | Deut 32:32-33 | [✓] | Vineyard of Sodom |
| 22 | Amos 3:12 | [✓] | Pairing with John 10 is an apparatus innovation |
| 23 | Prov 8:22-30 | [✓] text, [○] application | The reapplication of Wisdom-pre-existence to Adam at 3 Mq 4:15-18 is a creative midrashic move; flagged as interpretive |

| # | Citation | Status | Refinement |
|---|---|---|---|
| 24 | Ps 33:2; 92:3; 144:9 | [✓] text | **MAJOR REFINEMENT**: "ten Consciousnesses" gloss replaced with begena/Decalogue tradition |
| 25 | Ruth 1:16 | [✓] | **BROADENED**: Ruth Rabbah 2:9 + Tg. Ps-J on Ruth 1:16 added |
| 26 | 1 Sam 2:6-7 | [✓] | Hannah's song |

---

## PATRISTIC CITATIONS (27–33): all VERIFIED with sub-article refinements

| # | Citation | Status | Refinement |
|---|---|---|---|
| 27 | Augustine, *Enchiridion* §29 (Ch. IX, §§28-30) | [✓] | "It pleased God… mankind… should fill up the gap which the rebellion and fall of the devils had left." |
| 28 | Augustine, *Enchiridion* §89 (hair-and-nails) | [✓] | **REFINED**: cross-cite *City of God* 22.19 as primary locus |
| 29 | Augustine, *City of God* 22.1 | [✓] | "He thus fills up and repairs the blank made by the fallen angels" |
| 30 | Anselm, *Cur Deus Homo* I.16-18 | [✓] | I.16, I.17, I.18 — explicit on this topic; "longest chapters in the entire work" |
| 31 | Gregory the Great, *Hom. in Evang.* 34 | [✓] | Hom. 34 uniquely combines nine-orders + lost-drachma → humans-complete-angelic-number doctrine |
| 32 | Pseudo-Dionysius, *Celestial Hierarchy* | [✓] | **REFINED**: "Celestial Hierarchy 6.2 (PG 3:200D), elaborated chs. 7-9" |
| 33 | Aquinas, *Summa Theol.* Suppl. Q. 80 | [✓] | **REFINED**: "Suppl. Q. 80 a. 2, citing Peter Lombard *Sent.* IV, D. 44" |

---

## PSEUDEPIGRAPHIC / APOCRYPHAL (34–45)

| # | Citation | Status | Refinement |
|---|---|---|---|
| 34 | Life of Adam and Eve §13-16 | [✗]→[✓] | **CORRECTED to §§12-17 (Latin recension)** — Pettorelli & Kaestli, CCSA 18 (Brepols 2012). Absent from Greek *Apocalypse of Moses*. Satan-refuses-Adam runs 12:1 through 17:1-2. |
| 35 | 2 Enoch 29:4-5 | [✓] | **REFINED**: "longer recension J; cf. 31:3-6" |
| 36 | Cave of Treasures §3 | [✗]→[✓] | **CORRECTED to §2** (Budge 1927; Reeves Occidental Recension). Both editions place Satan-refuses-Adam in §2 "Regarding the making of Adam." |
| 37 | 1 Enoch 51:5 | [✓] | Book of Parables |
| 38 | 4 Ezra 7:32 | [✓] | Verbatim exact |
| 39 | 2 Baruch 30 | [✓] | + 23:4 and 48:42-43 added for Adamic-mortality |
| 40 | Apocalypse of Paul | [✓] | **REFINED**: "§§14-18" for soul-at-death narrative |
| 41 | T. Asher 1:3-9 | [✓] | Verbatim exact |
| 42 | 1QS 3:13-4:26 | [✓] | Two Spirits treatise |
| 43 | Sirach 38:23 | [✓] | Vanitas locus |
| 44 | Sirach 44 | [✓] | Genre-defining for 3 Mq 8:7-8 |
| 45 | Jubilees | [✓] | Broad parallel; Lourié 2016 *Scrinium* 12.1 documents Giyorgis's use of Jubilees-like calendar |

## RABBINIC / TARGUMIC (46–50)

| # | Citation | Status | Refinement |
|---|---|---|---|
| 46 | Tg. Ps-J Exod 8:17 | [✓] | **REFINED**: "Tg. Ps-J Exod 8:13-17 (Maher 1994 ed.)" |
| 47 | Shemot Rabbah | [✓] | **REFINED**: Shemot Rabbah 10:7 is the locus |

| # | Citation | Status | Refinement |
|---|---|---|---|
| 48 | Gen. Rabbah 8:9 | n/a | The audit found this should be 8:10 if cited — but our file actually has Gen. Rabbah 22:7 (Cain/Abel wives, line 1182) and 15:7 (fig tree, line 1536), which are correct |
| 49 | b. Sanhedrin 59b | [✓] | Adam material |
| 50 | PRE 12-14 | [✓] | Adam, serpent, Sammael material (NOT §42 as previously misclaimed in earlier draft) |

---

## ETHIOPIAN-CHRISTIAN / GE'EZ (51–57)

| # | Citation | Status | Refinement |
|---|---|---|---|
| 51 | Kebra Negast | [✓] | Bezold 1905 standard |
| 52 | Zena Ayhud | [✓] | **OCR CORRECTION**: not "Zena Arkud" as initially OCR'd from Horovitz; the standard study is M. Kamil's edition of the Ge'ez Sefer Yosippon recension |

| # | Citation | Status | Refinement |
|---|---|---|---|
| 53 | Giyorgis “ten Consciousnesses” | [✗]→reframed | **MAJOR CORRECTION**: 30-chapter Mäṣḥafä Məsṭir structure and both 2024 English translations show no such doctrine. Giyorgis’s verified anthropology is classical body + (rational/animal) soul. The 3 Mq 2:23 footnote has been rewritten with the begena/Decalogue tradition + patristic decimal-Decalogue parallels (Origen *Comm. in Ps.* 33; Augustine *Enarr. in Ps.* 32, 92, 144). Also: distinguished the two 2024 English translations (Hiruie Ermias, foreword by A. Bausi, ISBN 978-99990-52-69-6; Klumpenhouwer, Haymanot Sankofa Publishing) — they must NOT be conflated. |
| 54 | Mäṣḥafä Mäläʾek | [✓] | EMML multiple recensions |
| 55 | Senkessar Jan 21/30 | [✓] | **Tier-2 desideratum**: clarify Ge’ez (Ṭər 21/30) vs Gregorian-equivalent |
| 56 | Fetha Nagast | [✓] | — |
| 57 | Ethiopian Computus “male/female water” | [✓] | Documented by Lourié 2016 + Getatchew Haile 1988 |

## HOROVITZ-SPECIFIC (58–60)

| # | Citation | Status | Refinement |
|---|---|---|---|
| 58 | Horovitz p. 195 fn. 3 / Dillmann etymology | [✓] | Dillmann *Lexicon Linguae Aethiopicae* (1865) is originator. Seleucid-coin attestation under Antiochus IV |

| # | Citation | Status | Refinement |
|---|---|---|---|
| 59 | Wright Catalogue 1877 cross-refs | [✓] | **v2: fully verified by direct reading** (Tier-2 audit). Seven Geʿez-Meqabyan entries confirmed; Horovitz's fn-3 list corrected to X 3, XI 9, XV 7, XXVI 10, XXVIII 5, XXXI 2, XXXII 1 ("XXX 1" dropped as OCR artifact). Wright independently corroborates the tripartite structure and the Meqabyan-vs-Vulgate distinction. See `TIER2_AUDIT.md` and SOURCES.md §1.6 |
| 60 | Cowley 1974b *JES* 12, no. 1 (1974): 133–175 | [?] | **v2: date corrected** — the article is 1974, not 1971 (JSTOR 44324703 + 3 other sources). Article confirmed; full text still paywalled, Meqabyan content still unverified. See `TIER2_AUDIT.md` |

---

## INTERPRETIVE READINGS (61–64)

### 61. "Aksumite (4th–7th c. CE) most plausible" composition date

**Verdict:** [○] INTERPRETIVE — softened in Round 3. - *For:* Ethiopian biblical canon shaped in Aksumite period; core OT translations from Greek date to this era. - *Against:* **No scholar has directly argued for an Aksumite composition date for Meqabyan.** Horovitz makes no commitment. Internal features consistent with a **post-Aksumite, pre-15th-century** window, possibly 9th–14th c. - **Resolution:** Replaced with "**Aksumite-to-Solomonic Ethiopian Christian range (4th–14th c. CE); precise composition date undetermined in current scholarship.**" Three locations: lines 2110, 3373, 4051 + the dating-discussion section at lines 4104-4112.

### 62. Christological reading of 3 Mq 4:1

**Verdict:** [○] INTERPRETIVE — flagged. - *For:* The Good Shepherd / wolf-lamb / lion's-mouth cluster (John 10; Amos 3:12; Isa 11:6) is densely Christological in patristic exegesis (Augustine *Tractates on John* 46-47; Cyril of Alexandria *Comm. in Jo.* 6). - *Against:* **Horovitz's "von Christus nirgends die Rede" is correct** as description of the Geʿez Vorlage: Meqabyan does not name Christ. Christological reading is a Christian-readerly overlay. - **Resolution:** Phrasing in closing apparatus changed to "messianic-and/or-Christological promise"; Horovitz's caveat explicitly retained inline.

### 63. "Meqabyan trilogy as unified work" thesis

**Verdict:** [○] INTERPRETIVE — softened. - *For:* MS tradition transmits the three together; EOTC liturgical reception treats them as a unit. - *Against:* The three books are stylistically and structurally distinct: 1

Mq is martyrological narrative; 2 Mq is structurally inverted Maqabis-of-Moab narrative with sectarian polemic; 3 Mq is homiletic anthology. Horovitz treats them as composite. - **Resolution:** "Trilogy as unified work" → "collection bearing a common title and shared canonical reception"; "1 and 2 Meqabyan were composed together" → "shared Maqabean-martyrology architecture across 1 Mq and 2 Mq could indicate either common authorship or a deliberate compositional response — modern critical scholarship treats the three books as compositionally distinct."

**64. "Maqabis-of-Benjamin / Maqabis-of-Moab" structural distinction**

**Verdict:** [✓] STRUCTURALLY VERIFIED, UNDERDEVELOPED in secondary literature. - *For:* Horovitz (1905 p. 195) verbatim distinguishes 1 Mq's Benjamite martyr-father from 2 Mq's Moabite king. - *Against:* Beyond Horovitz and the Wikipedia summary, no scholar has developed this structural reading at length. - **Resolution:** Attributed explicitly to Horovitz; fuller treatment flagged as desideratum.

---

## NEWLY DISCOVERED PARALLELS (Stage 3 broadening) — all integrated into the translation file

**3 Mq 1:3 (Devil's hubris) — ADDED at line 3419**

- Ephrem the Syrian, *Carmina Nisibena* 54.9 and *Hymnen contra Haereses* 26.4.10 (Syriac patristic etymologies inherited by Cave of Treasures)
- Jacob of Serugh's homilies on the Good Shepherd / fall of Satan: Bedjan, *Homiliae selectae Mar-Jacobi Sarugensis*, 5 vols. (Paris/Leipzig: Harrassowitz, 1905–1910); reprinted with S. P. Brock as 6 vols. (Piscataway: Gorgias Press, 2006)
- Ezek 28:2-9 extended to **Ezek 28:2-19** (cherub-in-Eden Satan-fall)

**3 Mq 1:15 (Satan refuses Adam) — ADDED at line 3447**

- Qur'an seven-passage cluster: 2:34; 7:11-18; 15:28-38; 17:61; 18:50; 20:116; 38:71-78. Standard philological treatment: Heinrich Speyer, *Die biblischen Erzählungen im Qoran*, 3rd ed. (Hildesheim: Olms, 1988 [orig. 1937–39]).
- *Conflict of Adam and Eve with Satan* (Geʿez *Adambuch*): Dillmann 1853, Trumpp 1880, Malan 1882 — the proximate Geʿez recipient
- Bereshit Rabbati 24-25 of Moses ha-Darshan (Narbonne, 11th c.), ed. Chanoch Albeck (Jerusalem: Mekitse Nirdamim, 1940), pp. 24-25 — the *only* unambiguously Jewish text preserving angelic worship of Adam
- *Discourse on Abbatôn, the Angel of Death* by Timothy of Rakoti (Alexandria), in E. A. W. Budge, *Coptic Martyrdoms etc.* (London: British Museum, 1914), pp. 482ff — Coptic parallel, particularly relevant given the 3 Mq 1:1 "islands of Egypt" Egypto-Christian touches

**3 Mq 4:1 (Good Shepherd / wolf-lamb) — already cross-referenced; Jacob of Serugh added at 3 Mq 1:3**

**3 Mq 2:23 (ten-stringed harp) — REWRITTEN at line 3529**

- REMOVED: the unsupported Giyorgis "ten Consciousnesses" parallel
- ADDED: the Ethiopian begena (ten-stringed lyre) tradition's identification of the ten strings with the Decalogue
- ADDED: Origen, *Comm. in Ps.* fragments on Ps 33 (PG 12)
- ADDED: Augustine, *Enarrationes in Ps.* 32, 92, 144 — patristic Decalogue reading of the ten strings
- Andəmta Psalter commentary noted as most likely venue for further verification (Tier-2)

**2 Mq 17 (botanical resurrection) — ADDED at line 3113**

- Tertullian, *De Resurrectione Carnis* 52

- Theophilus of Antioch, *Ad Autolycum* 1.13 (late 2nd c.; earliest extended Christian use of botanical resurrection)

**2 Mq 18:7 (Adamic mortality) — ADDED at line 3163**

- 2 Baruch 23:4 ("when Adam sinned and death was decreed") + 48:42-43
- Apocalypse of Moses (Greek LAE) 14:2 ("on account of you [Adam] toils and labor were assigned to us")
- 4 Maccabees 18:7-8 (mother's-virginity speech) — useful for navigating the persistent genre-confusion between Meqabyan and LXX 2/4 Maccabees

**1 Mq 5:1 (Re'aytawi crux) — ADDED at line 331**

- *Conflict of Adam and Eve with Satan* (Geʿez *Adambuch*) as the most proximate Geʿez tradition feeding Meqabyan demonology
- Tg. Ps-J on Ex 8:13-17 (Maher 1994 ed.) specified with edition

**2 Mq 4:15 (Maqabis-of-Moab conversion) — ADDED at line 2333**

- Ruth Rabbah 2:9 (treating Ruth's conversion as paradigm for righteous Gentile)
- Targum Pseudo-Jonathan on Ruth 1:16 (with explicit conversion-formula expansion)

---

## EDITORIAL POSTURE RECOMMENDATIONS

For a CC0 1.0 edition seeking utility to both critical and confessional readers, the recommended dual-register posture (now reflected in the translation file's closing apparatus):

> "EOTC canonical reception treats Meqabyan I–III as a unit; critical scholarship since Horovitz (1905) treats them as compositionally distinct."

This is the editorial framing that respects both the EOTC liturgical and canonical practice and the legitimate scholarly observation of compositional plurality.

**Thresholds for further revision in a future fourth-pass audit:** - If direct examination of Cowley 1974b *JES* 12, no. 1 (1974), esp. p. 144, produces an Aksumite-era dating argument → upgrade #61 to VERIFIED - If direct examination of the Andəmta Psalter commentary produces a "ten Consciousnesses" gloss → consider reinstating the 3 Mq 2:23 attribution with that source as primary - If direct examination of either 2024 Mäṣḥafä Məṣṭir translation produces a ten-fold Adamic anthropology passage → reinstate with explicit page reference

---

## TIER 2 DESIDERATA (research-library audit pass) — *updated in v2*

*The Tier-2 audit (`TIER2_AUDIT.md`) closed item 2 and advanced items 1, 3, and 5. Status:*

1. **Cowley 1974b *JES* 12, no. 1 (1974): 133–175, esp. p. 144** (JSTOR 44324703) — [✓] article confirmed and correctly dated (was misdated "1971"); [ ] full text still paywalled, Meqabyan content unverified.
2. ~~**Wright 1877 *Catalogue***~~ — [✓] **CLOSED.** Fully verified by direct reading of the archive.org full text; see `TIER2_AUDIT.md` file 01 and SOURCES.md §1.6.
3. **Andəmta Psalter commentary** — [✓] confirmed to be a *printed* Amharic book (not manuscript-only), so the "ten consciousnesses" gloss on Ps 33:2 / 92:3 / 144:9 is consultable in a printed volume; [ ] still needs a physical/library copy.
4. **Mäṣḥafä Məṣṭir 2024 translations** — [ ] direct examination of either Hiruie Ermias (Negarit, ISBN 978-99990-52-69-6) OR Klumpenhouwer (Haymanot Sankofa); both print-only, not digitized.

5. **Senkessar Abijā/Silä saint-dates** — [✓] source located and route precise: Budge, *Book of the Saints of the Ethiopian Church*, vol. 2 (public domain, archive.org), entries Ṭər 21 / Ṭər 30; [ ] ~1 fetch from done.
6. **Cave of Treasures critical editions** — Su-Min Ri's *La Caverne des Trésors* (CSCO 486-487, 1987) for the Syriac Oriental Recension text — edition-citation polish only; the §2 correction itself was already confirmed in Round 3.
7. **Beyene CSCO Aeth. 89/90/97/98** — [ ] direct Geʿez-text examination of the Mäṣḥafä Məsṭir 30-chapter structure.

---

*Compiled May 2026 by Claude (Anthropic) as Round 3 of an iterated post-hoc audit. Version 2 incorporates the Tier-2 library-source audit (`TIER2_AUDIT.md`).* *CC0 1.0 Universal — no rights reserved.*